

THE LEGITIMACY OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS

Editors

NOBUO HAYASHI AND CECILIA
M. BAILLIET

Assistant Editor

JOANNA NICHOLSON



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

1128289

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316509401

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

First paperback edition 2018

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Hayashi, Nobuo, editor. | Bailliet, Cecilia, editor.

The legitimacy of international criminal tribunals / editors, Nobuo Hayashi and Cecilia M. Bailliet ; assistant editor, Joanna Nicholson.

Cambridge [UK] : Cambridge University Press, [2016]

LCCN 2016026627 | ISBN 9781107146174

LCSH: International criminal courts. | International Criminal Court.

LCC KZ7230 .L44 2016 | DDC 345/.01-dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016026627>

ISBN 978-1-107-14617-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-50940-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

| | |
|------------------------------|--------|
| <i>List of Contributors</i> | page x |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | xviii |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i> | xix |

Introduction 1

NOBUO HAYASHI, CECILIA M. BAILLIET, AND JOANNA
NICHOLSON

PART I Theories and Perspectives 23

- 1 The Legitimacy of International Criminal Tribunals 25
LARRY MAY AND SHANNON FYFE
- 2 Conceptualising and Measuring the Legitimacy of
International Criminal Tribunals 41
SILJE AAMBØ LANGVATN AND THERESA SQUATRITO
- 3 Between International Criminal Justice and Injustice:
Theorising Legitimacy 66
SERGEY VASILIEV
- 4 Legitimacy, Legality, and the Possibility of a Pluralist
International Criminal Law 92
ASAD KIYANI
- 5 The Legitimacy and Effectiveness of International
Criminal Tribunals: A Criminal Policy Perspective 116
ATHANASIOS CHOULIARAS

PART II Norms and Objectives 139

- 6 Legitimacy and ICC Jurisdiction Following Security Council Referrals: Conduct on the Territory of Non-Party States and the Legality Principle 141

ROGIER BARTELS

- 7 Is the Yugoslav Tribunal Guilty of Hyper-Humanising International Humanitarian Law? 179

NOBUO HAYASHI

- 8 'One of the Challenges that can Plausibly be Raised Against Them'? On the Role of Truth in Debates about the Legitimacy of International Criminal Tribunals 206

JAKOB V.H. HOLTERMANN

- 9 Hidden Legitimacy: Crafting Judicial Narratives in the Shadow of Secrecy at a War Crimes Tribunal – A Speculation 228

TIMOTHY WILLIAM WATERS

PART III Complementarity and Regionalism 245

- 10 Positive Complementarity and Legitimacy – Is the International Criminal Court Shifting from Judicial Restraint Towards Interventionism? 247

IGNAZ STEGMILLER

- 11 African Supranational Criminal Jurisdiction: One Step Towards Ending Impunity or Two Steps Backwards for International Criminal Justice? 272

DOROTHY MAKAZA

- 12 Legitimacy Defects and Legal Flaws of the Special Tribunal for Lebanon: Dilemmas of the 'Peace Through Justice' Theorem 297

MARTIN WÄHLISCH

PART IV Parties to the Proceedings 323

- 13 Prosecutors' Opening Statements: The Rhetoric of Law, Politics, and Silent War 325

DAMIEN ROGERS

CONTENTS

ix

- 14 Effectiveness of International Criminal Tribunals:
Empirical Assessment of Rehabilitation as Sentencing
Goal 351
BARBORA HOLA, JESSICA KELDER, AND JORIS
VAN WIJK
- 15 Procedural Justice, Legitimacy, and Victim Participation
in Uganda 376
STEPHEN SMITH CODY
- PART V States and NGOs 399**
- 16 Things Fall Apart: Battles of Legitimation and the Politics
of Noncompliance and African Sovereignty from the
Rwanda Tribunal to the ICC 401
VICTOR PESKIN
- 17 Financing Lady Justice: How the Funding Systems
of Ad Hoc Tribunals Could Lend Themselves to the
Possibility of Judicial Bias 426
MISTALE TAYLOR
- 18 Global Civil Society, the ICC, and Legitimacy in
International Criminal Justice 449
KJERSTI LOHNE

Index 473